Meningococcal immunisation in Ghana

Sir—Christopher Woods and colleagues (Jan 1, p 30) highlight their experience of a mass vaccination, to circumvent a meningococcal disease epidemic in Ghana, in 1997. The campaign resulted in a 72% coverage rate and is estimated to have prevented 23% of cases. Had the current WHO recommendations been followed, then 61% of cases would have been prevented, the investigators calculated. The investigators acknowledge that the same virtual proportion of prevented cases would have been obtained through a routine immunisation programme with a similar coverage achievement before onset of the epidemic. It is surprising then that the investigators assert with great assurance that, while awaiting meningococcal A conjugate vaccine, the actual strategy advocated by WHO is as effective and more practical than a strategy of routine vaccination with currently available vaccines. To scientifically correct it should be acknowledged that both strategies have drawbacks, as proved by the relatively low percentage of cases prevented. Logistic and threshold refinement may allow real improvement of the actual WHO strategy. But a study by Bovier and colleagues1 highlights that mass-vaccination strategy is less cost-effective than either routine preventive vaccination or a combination of routine and emergency mass vaccination. Moreover, concern has also been raised that the cost of a death averted by vaccination is fifteen times higher than the cost of a death averted by treatment. This implies that when a surveillance strategy is used the programme managers can be confronted with a difficult choice between vaccination or treatment. On the other hand, in high-risk districts of Bénin, routine vaccination with cost recovery was implemented with encouraging results in terms of vaccine coverage (60%), and possibly in reducing the risk of meningococcal epidemics.2 Because there is no scientific evidence that proves one strategy to be more practical than any other, it would be detrimental to discourage additional efforts to improve responses to a major public health problem yet unresolved, especially when those efforts prove cost-effective.

*François de Chabalier, Jean Philippe Chipaux, Achille Massougbodi
*Centre de Recherche sur les Meningites et les Séquelles annexes, BP 10067, N’Djaména, Niger; Institut de Recherche et Développement, Niamey, Niger; and Faculté des Sciences de la Santé, Cocotoul, Bénin


Sir—Christopher Woods and colleagues' used data from the Ghana meningitis epidemic of 1997 to stimulate the potential effectiveness of various vaccination strategies. We disagree with the investigators' conclusion that WHO threshold-based meningitis control strategy is the best strategy. First, we think that this strategy is not feasible in field circumstances—as the Ghana outbreak exemplified. Experience from other meningitis-belt countries also showed that effective vaccination coverage of 85% was hardly ever reached within 1 week from crossing the epidemic threshold and that in reality delays were in the order of 2 months or more.3 The delays were due, between the crossing of the threshold and the declaration of the epidemic, to weaknesses in the surveillance system and, subsequently, to resource and logistic constraints. Despite rather exceptionally favourable circumstances (awareness of on-going epidemics in neighbouring countries, immunisation teams at stand-by, and a reasonably well-organised health service) the actual delay to reach effective immunisation coverage in Ghana was, as reported by Woods and colleagues, 3 months. The level of disease reduction (18% of deaths prevented) remained far below the one (72%) that could theoretically be achieved when applying the strategy recommended by WHO.

Our bone of contention concerns the apparently inevitable delays. They are a manifestation of the influence of external factors (eg, financing) on the health sector affecting routine service delivery (including Expanded Programme on Immunisation [EPI]) and, even more, the capacity to adequately respond in an emergency situation. Also, the investigators failed to mention the crucial importance of adequate EPI management of meningitis in epidemic situations.4 It is too often observed that all energy goes into implementing a hopelessly delayed vaccination strategy, with foreseeable poor results, without giving due priority to providing access to treatment for those with the illness. Yet, cost-effectiveness analysis has shown that treatment with a single dose of oily chromatoporphin is superior to immunisation.5 The availability of this orphan drug is hence one of the cornerstones of current meningitis response, and should be guaranteed. We ought not to sit back because of the conclusions drawn by Woods and colleagues, but actively support all initiatives that strive for universal access to essential drugs while promoting research for better and affordable meningococcal vaccines that provide long-lasting immunity. These affordable vaccines could then be integrated into the EPI-schemes of the countries in the meningitis belt.

*Dedzo McDamien, Marleen Boelaert, Wim Van Damme, Patrick Van der Stuyf

*Ministry of Health, Accra, Ghana; Epidemiology Unit, Prince Leopold Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium, and Médecins Sans Frontières, Phnom Penh, Cambodia


Authors’ reply

Sir—We agree with François de Chabalier, Dedzo McDamien, and their colleagues that logistics may impede implementation of a threshold strategy, but routine vaccination strategies have similar problems. Additional approaches, including vaccination of school children and cost-recovery should be assessed, but these approaches are unlikely to be widely applicable. The cost-effectiveness analysis assumes that vaccination of children aged 5 years will have the same cost and coverage as the routine EPI, but EPI does not target children aged 5 years; further, in some of the most severely affected meningitis-belt

THE LANCET • Vol 355 • June 24, 2000

2252

Fonds Documentaire IRD

Cote: Ex 22760

Ex : 1
EDITORIAL

2177 Safeguarding participants in clinical trials

COMMENTARY

2178 Symptomless infection with Ebola virus
A G Baxter

2179 Quantitative tests for human papillomavirus
C Johnston

2180 Strategies for coronary stenting
R H Stables

2181 Insulin resistance, iron, and the liver
E Ferrannini

2183 Short cut to continence?
J Bidmead, L Cardozo

2184 Pendulum test in cerebral palsy
H K Graham

ARTICLES

2185 Inhibitors of hydroxymethylglutaryl-coenzyme A reductase and risk of fracture among older women
K A Chan and others

2186 Viral load of human papillomavirus 16 as a determinant for development of cervical carcinoma in situ
A Josefsson and others

2187 Consistent high viral load of human papillomavirus 16 and risk of cervical carcinoma in situ
N Ylitalo and others

2188 Optimum percutaneous transluminal coronary angioplasty compared with primary stent strategy trial (OPUS-1)
W D Weaver and others

2189 War and mortality in Kosovo, 1998–99: an epidemiological testimony
P B Spiegel, P Salama

EARLY REPORT

2201 Human asymptomatic Ebola infection and strong inflammatory response
E M Leroy and others

CASE REPORT

2202 A girl who laughed and fell down
M Bellman and others

RESEARCH LETTERS

2203 Stopping primary prophylaxis in HIV-1-infected patients at high risk of toxoplasma encephalitis
H Farrer and others

2204 Oral statins and increased bone-mineral density in postmenopausal women
C J Edwards and others

2205 Reassessing artificial bowel sphincters
A J Malouf and others

2206 Treatment of DYT1-generalised dystonia by stimulation of the internal globus pallidus
P Coubes and others

2207 Stability and sterility of recombinant tissue plasminogen activator at -30°C
J T Wierinkowski and others

2208 Relation between cholinesterase inhibitor and Pisa syndrome
Y T Kwak and others

NEWS

Science & medicine

2223 WHO compares health-care systems
New class of drugs for TB treatment

2224 Functional MRI—doubts laid to rest?
Views on schizophrenia “startle” test

2225 GM mosquitoes and malaria control
Colonooscopy and cancer screening

Policy & people

2228 Dutch ship plans to provide abortions
Calls for better diagnosis of breech babies

2229 UK revalidation strategy for doctors

2230 UK heroin contaminant revealed
Cocaine use in Spain increases

PUBLIC HEALTH

2231 North and South: bridging the information gap
R Horton

WORLD AIDS

2232 Advances and research directions in the prevention of mother-to-child HIV-1 transmission
L M Mofenson, J A McIntyre

VIEWPOINT

2245 Antimalarial drug combination policy: a caveat
C Wongarichanalai

Contents list continues inside

Registered as a newspaper. ISSN 0140-6736.